Animal Abuse, Animal Hoarding and Elder Abuse: Challenges and Strategies for Adult Protective Services

National Adult Protective Services Association
Webinar – April 29, 2020

Presenters:

Phil Arkow
Coordinator
National Link Coalition
(The National Resource Center on The Link between Animal Abuse & Human Violence)
Etowah, NC
arkowpets@snip.net

Jessica Bibbo, Ph.D.
Research Scientist
Center for Research and Education,
Benjamin Rose Institute on Aging
Cleveland, OH
jbibbo@benrose.org

Kara Holmquist, J.D.
Director of Advocacy
Massachusetts SPCA/Angell Memorial Hospital
Boston, MA
kholmquist@mspca.org
WHAT IS THE NATIONAL LINK COALITION?

National Resource Center.
4,100+ members, 50 states, 57 countries.
Informal collaboration addressing linkages, prevention and response to animal abuse, domestic violence, child maltreatment and elder abuse.
Policy, programs, awareness, & research (1,400+ citations).
LINK-Letter, local coalitions, trainings.

By recognizing how human and animal violence are intertwined, violence prevention is enhanced and families and communities are safer.
Pets --
ALL IN THE FAMILY!

• More homes have pets than children.
• More money on pet food than baby food.
• More dogs than people in European countries
• More cats than dogs.
• Pet industry: 7th largest retail sector.
• *Children more likely to grow up with pets than with a father.*
• Ironically, seniors – the cohort who might benefit most from pets’ companionship and unconditional regard – are the least likely to own pets.
How Do Families See Their Pets?

Roles of Pets in U.S. Households

- Companions: 35.8%
- Family Members: 63.2%
- Property: 1%

Challenge

AVMA: U.S. Pet Ownership & Demographics Sourcebook, 2012
The good news for isolated seniors....

Pets can enhance and facilitate social capital:

A “ripple effect extending beyond individual health benefits to their owners to non-pet owners and the broader community.”
- 40.5% of pet owners know other people through pets.
- 75.8% walk about more frequently... an obesity control trick!
- 83.8% of dog walkers talk to other people.
- Pets create a community with a sense of safety.

Pets and Vulnerable Adults: The “Good Side” of the Human-Animal Bond

“A PET IS AN ISLAND OF SANITY IN WHAT APPEARS TO BE AN INSANE WORLD.”

-- Boris Levinson
Pets and Vulnerable Adults: The “Good Side” of the Human-Animal Bond

“IT’S NOT THAT THE NURSING HOMES ARE GOING TO THE DOGS...”

“...The dogs are going to the nursing homes, and every indication is that the residents love it. Happiness really is a warm puppy!”
“When people maintain patterns of caring, whether for a house, a garden, pets or people, they are protecting themselves against despair, against giving up. After retirement, people are urged to give up cares. It can be a lethal tradeoff. The person who stops caring for something may have taken the first steps to the helplessness/hopelessness syndrome. And those who cope best with old age are those who continue the daily acts of caring, especially the most satisfying ones – care rendered to living things, such as pets and gardens.”

-- Beck & Katcher, 1996
Pets and the Elderly: The Good... The Bad, and the Ugly
Animal Abuse:
It’s the tip of the iceberg...
What is the “Link” between Animal Abuse and other forms of Family Violence?

“When animals are abused, people are at risk; When people are abused, animals are at risk.”
Relevance for APS:

1. Animal neglect may also indicate challenges in self-care and need for assistance:
   - memory loss
   - fixed/low income
   - physical frailness
   - transportation limitations
   - social isolation
   - animal hoarding

2. Additional eyes & ears: Animal control/protection often first on scene
Animal Abuse and Child Abuse

The “Little Mary Ellen” Case (1874)

Henry Bergh, Founder American SPCA (1866)
The battered-child syndrome, a clinical condition in young children who have received serious physical abuse, is a frequent cause of permanent injury or death. The syndrome should be considered in any child exhibiting evidence of fracture of any bone, subdural hematoma, failure to thrive, soft tissue swellings or skin bruising, in any child who dies suddenly, or where the degree and type of injury is at variance with the history given regarding the occurrence of the trauma. Psychiatric factors are probably of prime importance in the pathogenesis of the disorder, but knowledge of these factors is limited. Physicians have a duty and responsibility to the child to require a full evaluation of the problem and to guarantee that no expected repetition of trauma will be permitted to occur.
Animal Abuse and Child Abuse

- 60% of pet-owning families meeting New Jersey’s criteria for child abuse or neglect also had abused or neglected pets

- Animal abuse in 88% of families with physical child abuse

- Bite rate was 11x greater

- Veterinary usage similar to general population

(DeViney, Dickert & Lockwood, N.J.)
Animal Abuse and Domestic Violence

Emotional extortion – Intimidation – Retaliation

71% of shelter women: husband or boyfriend killed, harmed or threatened an animal.

32%: children hurt or killed animals.

87% in presence of women.
75% in presence of the children.
Animal Abuse and Domestic Violence

Batterers who also abuse pets:
  • use more forms of violence and
  • are more dangerous
... than batterers who do not abuse pets.

History of pet abuse one of the 4 most significant risk factors of becoming a batterer.

18% - 48% of battered women do not leave abusers, fearing for their animals’ safety.
Domestic Violence and Animal Abuse: What’s the Risk?

IPV suspects with histories of pet abuse are significantly more likely to have had previous violent incidents. Victims reported:

- 80% had had at least one prior unreported IPV incident
- 76% had been strangled
- 26% had been forced to have sex with the suspect
- 80% fear they will be killed by the suspect
- Lethality risk to first responders doubles.

-- Campbell, Thompson et al, 2018
Man who allegedly beat wife, killed kitten is held

BY ROBIN ERB
BLADE STAFF WRITER

An East Toledo man accused of killing his wife’s kitten by putting it in an oven set at 500 degrees and then telling her “Your dinner’s ready” appeared in court yesterday on animal cruelty and domestic violence charges.

Dennis Davis, 56, of Main Street, was ordered held in the Lucas County jail in lieu of $8,500 bond by Judge Mary Trimboli of Toledo Municipal Court. “Just when you think they’ve found every way possible to manipulate someone, somebody comes up with something new,” said Sam Nugent, chief prosecutor. “This is quite brutal, quite unnerving.”

“I’ve never had anything like this,” Kevin Warner, a Toledo Humane Society investigator, said.

The case began about 3:30 p.m. Jan. 9, according to a police report filed by Roberta Davis, 41, who told officers that she is seeking a divorce from her husband.

Ms. Davis, who did not call police at the time but went to the downtown police station See KITTEN, Page 18 ▶
**Domestic Violence Responses**

“Doggie Witness Protection Programs”

**Off-site foster care: “Safe Havens”**

600+ women’s shelters: Foster referrals

[www.SafePlaceForPets.org](http://www.SafePlaceForPets.org)

**On-site co-sheltering: “SAF-T” – Sheltering Animals & Families Together**

160+ pet-friendly women’s shelters in US, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the Netherlands, Spain)

[www.SAFTprogram.org](http://www.SAFTprogram.org)
Animal Abuse and Domestic Violence

A serious, understudied rural issue...

“It wasn’t just the cats and dogs, it was the sheep and the chickens. I was terrified for their welfare. I knew if I were to leave, he wouldn’t hesitate to kill them. He had done it before.”

-- New York Times 4/1/06

Susan Walsh, 50...
The Link Helps Resolve Ongoing Challenges:
Better support for IPV survivors:
Pet Protection Orders
Policy and Practice Responses: Pets and Divorce Settlements

States Where Divorce Courts Can Award Custody of Pets in the ANIMALS’ BEST INTERESTS
Legislative Responses
Coercive Animal Abuse =
Domestic Violence or Elder Abuse
Animal Abuse and APS Caseworkers

• **35%**: clients talk about pets threatened, injured, killed, or denied care.

• **45%**: intentional animal abuse or neglect.

• **92%**: co-existing animal and self-neglect: animal neglect an important warning sign.

• **75%**: clients’ concern for pets’ welfare affected decisions about accepting interventions or other services.

Survey of 200 APS professionals
HSUS & National Center on Elder Abuse
Animal Abuse and APS Caseworkers

“Her decision to go to the hospital depended on what happened to her cat. Her recovery depended on the cat’s well being. So I had to find someone to care for her cat. I never thought that animal welfare would be of my job!”

-- APS caseworker, reported in Boat & Knight
From the National Link Coalition’s Case Files: Animal abuse linked with elder abuse...

NY man accused of beating his father, then stealing, sexually assaulting and killing neighbor’s dog...

RI man holds elderly mother’s cat hostage for $20,000 ransom...

FL man charged with killing mother’s three dogs in jealous rage – believed she loved them more than him...

CA woman with starving horses charged with elder abuse when mother found covered in feces & urine...

FL investigation into dog slashed with sword uncovers brutal beatings of nursing home resident...

CA Family with autistic son catch caregiver viciously beating boy – and uncover histories of felony animal neglect and murder ...
Elders & Animals -- Issues for APS

1. Pet neglect (forget to feed; overfeed; don’t let out; vet care)
2. Self-neglect (forgo food, hospital, LTHC; eat pet food)
3. Attachment and pet loss (sole companion, exercise, social connection, link to loved one)
4. Safety of caseworker/home health aide/homemaker services (litter boxes, sink, vermin; aggression)
5. Extortion
6. Jealousy over service animal
7. Hoarding/collecting…
Elders and Animal Hoarding

DEFINITION:

• Intense emotional attachments → accumulates large # of animals.
• Fail to provide minimal standards of nutrition, sanitation & vet care.
• Fail to act on deteriorating condition of animals or environment.
• State of denial: Fail to recognize negative impact on their own health and well-being.
Elders & Animals -- Issues for APS

Animal hoarding

- Not a harmless eccentricity, but a potentially serious problem for people, animals and the community.

- Multi-disciplinary response always required: APS, animal shelter, law enforcement, public health, fire dept., code enforcement, mental health, veterinarians.

- Animals may be dead or alive.

- *Recidivism rate: 100%.*
WHY DO PEOPLE HOARD ANIMALS?

Animals provide us with:
• Reward
• Acceptance
• Conflict-free relationships
• Sense of self-worth

_Hoarders carry to extreme_

“Some people who have difficulty establishing supportive interpersonal relationships or who otherwise have difficulty coping with life stressors find refuge in animals.”

Gary Patronek, VMD
Hoarders of Animals Research Consortium
Animal Hoarding: A self-perpetuating cycle

- Isolation a **cause** of accumulation of animals
- Isolation a **result** of accumulation of animals
FOUR TYPES OF ANIMAL HOARDERS

1. Mental Illness

2. Overwhelmed hoarder

3. Rescue Hoarder

4. Exploiter Hoarders...
Types of Animal Hoarders

1. Mental Illness
Not OCD but disordered attachment from early childhood trauma & life stressors.

Psychological Disorders Identified
- Addiction Model
- Schizophrenia
- Antisocial Personality
- Psychopathic Personality
- Agoraphobia
- Dementia
- Borderline Personality
- Depression
- Münchausen by Proxy
Types of Animal Hoarders

2. Overwhelmed: Good intentions gone bad

• Sincere desire but overwhelmed
  (word gets out as THE place to take unwanted animals).
Types of Animal Hoarders

3. Rescuers

- Deep mistrust of others: see self as only one who can help
- Anti-euthanasia
- Identity tied to animals
- May rescue specific breeds (or colors)
- May rescue hospice cases, dying animals
Types of Animal Hoarders

4. Exploiters: Greed or criminal intent

• Solicit $ from public.

• Get animals to serve themselves.

• Actively pick up animals, evade law.
APS Issues in Animal Hoarding

- 9%: histories of mental health treatment.
- 14%: histories of elder abuse.
- 11%: require crisis responses.
- 47%: have dead or dying animals.
- Only 14% connected to traditional social services (e.g., Meals on Wheels, DSS).
- Physical health issues (rarely leave house; don’t see MDs; zoonoses).
- Malnutrition.
- Hazardous environments (fire/ammonia hazards, non-working utilities, odor, infestations).

-- Jenny Coffey, Mayor’s Alliance for Animals/Urban Hoarding Project, New York City
What To Do?

Advantages of prosecution

• Opportunity for evaluation and risk assessment.
• Opportunity to evaluate animals.
• Can do long-term monitoring (recommended!).
• Court-ordered restitution of costs.
• Limits on animal ownership.
• Limits on animal-related employment.
• Law-enforcement public record.
• Makes them accountable.
• Educates public about seriousness of the issue.
What To Do?

Disadvantages of prosecution

- Criminalizes behavior that may really be mental illness.
- Alienates public or judiciary unfamiliar with the extent of the problem.
- May not draw upon the community resources in the best position to provide long-term monitoring and solutions (e.g. mental health, adult protective services, animal care and control).
- Costly and time-consuming.
Elders and Animal Hoarding

REMEDIES AND RESPONSES

• Foster housing, vet care, euthanasia of large #s of animals, mobile clinic for spay/neuter.

• May require court order.

• Psych counseling, social services.

• Prepare for media interest.

• Allow to keep limited #.

• Frequent check-backs.
Other Issues: Humane Housing for Older People & Pets

Dilemma: elder may be forced to surrender pets when move to subsidized housing
Humane Housing for Older People & Pets

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS!

Housing & Urban-Rural Recovery Act, Sec. 227 (12 U.S.C. #1701r-1)
- disabled or 62+ can keep “common” household pets in federally-assisted housing for elderly or disabled.

- pet deposits vary on rent subsidy, capped at $300, can be paid in installments
Humane Housing for Older People & Pets

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS!**

State laws protect rights of elderly and disabled to keep pets in state-subsidized housing

AZ*, CA, CT, DC*, MA, MN*, NH, NJ*

(* = pet rights also guaranteed in private housing)
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

1. Ask questions in intakes, interviews, assessments,:
   - Clients more likely to talk about animals than themselves
   - Your concern for pet --> trust
   - Does client have vet?

   “Are there animals at home?”
   “How are they cared for?”
   “Are you worried about their welfare?”
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

1. Ask questions in assessments, interviews, intakes
   • “Has anyone ever hurt or threatened your pet?”
   • “Are you worried about your pet’s safety or health?”
   • “Can you afford to care for your pet?”
   • “Are you, or your home aides, able to do the physical
tasks?” (change litter box, clean fish tank or bird
cage, walk dog, clean yard, go to vet)
   • “Is someone else available to care for pet?”
   • “Are you depressed over the loss of your pet?”
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

2. Home Visit Assessments
   • Risk reduction: Safety vs. fall
   • Ask about any recent health problems or injuries
   • Inadequate food/water/shelter
   • How is pet being exercised?
   • Pet clean-up
   • Pet food but no human food
   • Excess numbers of animals
   • Future planning: short- or long-term hospital/skilled nursing facility
     • Who will take care of animal?
     • Can pet come to visit?
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

3. Planning for Transitioning with Pets
   • What does client really want?
   • Does new residence allow pets?
   • How will pet transition?
   • May be more expensive.
   • Is pet a risk for client with increasing frailty?
   • Build in support system and future planning ahead of time.
   • Acclimate pet to new surroundings in advance.
   • Change addresses on tags.
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

4. End-of-Life Planning for Client and Pets
   • End-of-life wishes
   • Burial/cremation considerations
   • Hospice
   • Alert vets to suicide potential
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

5. Know who to call for referrals

• Pet care services for seniors/chronic illness (Humane society, SPCA, Animal services)
  (surrender, adoption, Safe Havens, low-cost vet/spay-neuter, foster care while in hospital, behavior counseling, pet food banks, meals-on-wheels)

• Who ‘Ya Gonna Call? *Abuse Busters!*

• Vets/vet associations/Vet schools
  • 24/7 grief/loss hotline
  • Pet loss support group
  • Veterinary Social Work

• Mobile groomers

• House-call veterinarians
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

6. Develop inter-agency relationships, MOU protocols
   • Cross-training
   • Cross-reporting
   • Join community coalitions
   • Invite SPCA/Animal Control to join APS MDTs
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

7. Identify pet-friendly rentals
   -- Animal shelter volunteers can compile list

Identify nursing homes/assisted living centers with animal-assisted activities
WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

8. If client is capable (physically, emotionally, mentally, financially) suggest a (low-maintenance) pet for companionship, responsibility, routine, exercise, social outreach

“Animal companions can relieve the anonymity often found in modern society, and can help build friendships. Dogs facilitate interaction among strangers and help establish trust among the newly acquainted.”

WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:

9. Find volunteer opportunities at animal shelters
10. Legislative advocacy: Cross-reporting

**WHAT APS CASEWORKERS CAN DO:**

APS mandated/permitted to report animal abuse
- California
- Louisiana
- Nebraska
- Tennessee
- West Virginia

*Map showing states where animal abuse is mandated to be reported.*

- **California**
- **Louisiana**
- **Nebraska**
- **Tennessee**
- **West Virginia**
Resources

www.NationalLinkCoalition.org
Subscribe to our free LINK-Letter
arkowpets@snip.net
(Please indicate which agency you’re with)
EXPLOITATION OF THE HUMAN-ANIMAL BOND: THE LINK AND ELDER JUSTICE

Jessica Bibbo, Ph.D.
Research Scientist

www.benrose.org
jbibbo@benrose.org
OLDER ADULTS AND THEIR PETS

The Human-Animal Bond

Companionship
(e.g., emotional/social support and engagement)

Opportunity for nurturance

Structure
- Motivator for health behaviors
EXPLOITING THE HUMAN-ANIMAL BOND

- Emotional Abuse
  - Pet as proxy
  - Physical abuse
- Financial Exploitation
- Self-Neglect
  - Animal hoarding
  - Animal neglect

The Human-Animal Bond

- Companionship (e.g., emotional/social support and engagement)
- Opportunity for nurturance
- Structure
  - Motivator for health behaviors
THE NEED FOR DATA AND RESEARCH

Title - Adult Protective Services and Animal Welfare: Should Animal Abuse and Neglect Be Assessed During Adult Protective Services Screening?

Authors - Terry Peak, Frank Ascione, and Jylisa Doney

Source - Journal of Elder Abuse and Neglect, 24 (1), 37-49, Jan-March 2012

Summary of Research - The purpose of this study was to survey Adult Protect Services (APS) representatives to assess how animal abuse issues are addressed in the context of elder abuse across the United States. The ultimate goal was to then take this information and develop an assessment protocol to collect information on animal welfare in cases of elderly abuse in Utah.
THE NEED FOR DATA AND RESEARCH

• 51% of respondents did not ask about pets

• Concerns for clients’ safety:
  Inability to care for the pet
  Spending money on pet instead of self
  Pet care in an emergency situation
THE NEED FOR DATA AND RESEARCH

- Documentation
  An initial and critical step
- Cross-Reporting
- Specific Types of Abuse and Neglect
- Effective Interventions
EXPLOITING THE HUMAN-ANIMAL BOND

- Child Maltreatment
- Animal Abuse
- Elder Abuse
- Domestic Violence
EXPLOITING THE HUMAN-ANIMAL BOND

- Child Maltreatment
- Animal Abuse
- Elder Abuse
- Domestic Violence
THANK YOU

JBIBBO@BENROSE.ORG
CHALLENGES OF ADVOCACY AND THE LINK: CROSS-REPORTING IN MASSACHUSETTS

Who are we?

- Founded in 1868 in response to animal cruelty
- Advocacy
- Law enforcement
- 2 animal hospitals (and 2 clinics at tech high schools)
- 3 animal care and adoption centers

Kara Holmquist, J.D. Massachusetts SPCA

mspca angell
Kindness and Care for Animals®
Pets in Housing: Pets allowed in elder and senior housing
Worked on early laws to allow pets in this type of housing in Mass.

Pets in Protective Orders
2012 laws to allow pets in these orders

Reporting of animal abuse/cross-reporting
2000—permitted veterinarians to report suspected animal cruelty.
2004—permitted the Department of Children and Families (DCF) employees or contractors to report animal abuse.
2014—required veterinarians to report animal cruelty.
2018—permitted the reporting of suspected animal cruelty by Elder Affairs employees and contractors.
2018—required Animal Control Officers to report suspected abuse of children, elders, and persons with disabilities.
MSPCA/Northeastern study
In the study, a number of cruelty cases prosecuted by the MSPCA between 1975 and 1996 were reviewed. Results indicate that 70 percent of those who committed crimes against animals had also been involved in other violent, property, drug, and disorderly crimes.
The study also concluded that a person who has committed animal abuse is:

- 5 times more likely to commit violence against people
- 4 times more likely to commit property crimes
- 3 times more likely to be involved in drunken or disorderly offenses
MSPCA and the Link

SafePet program
Providing temporary housing for people leaving DV situations, fires, COVID-19/other hospitalizations, homelessness

Community Outreach
We work in our communities to help with pet food, veterinary care, behavior help, etc.
Man in "Puppy Doe" case gets 8 to 10 years in prison for torturing his dog

Puppy Doe
2013
S. 2345 is Signed!

An Act protecting animal welfare and safety
- Increases penalties for animal abuse.
- Requires veterinarians to report suspected animal cruelty.
- Creates a task force to consider future protections for animals.
2 years

106-page report

PAWS II included most of recommendations passed into law

Mandated reporting provisions changed in House
PAWS II
Signed into Law 8/2018

• Help ensure abuse is reported
• Ensure that landlords check vacant properties for abandoned animals
• Prohibit the drowning of animals
• Ensure efficient enforcement of animal control laws
• Updates penalties and makes technical changes that improve enforcement of animal control laws
After PAWS II...

• Special commission created to study animal cruelty reporting provision as included in PAWS II
• Started to meet in 2018; still ongoing (slowed due to COVID-19)

There shall be a special commission to study and report on the:

feasibility and cost of mandating that employees and contractors of the department of children and families, employees and contractors of the department of elder affairs and investigators for the disabled persons protection commission report known or suspected animal cruelty, abuse and neglect, and of mandating that animal control officers report known or suspected abuse of children and elderly and disabled persons.
Serving on the Commission

- Legislators
- Division of Animal Health, Department of Agricultural Resources
- Disabled Persons Protection Commission
- Executive Office of Human Services
- Mass. Attorney General
- MSPCA-Angell
- Animal Rescue League of Boston
- Animal Control Officers Association of MA
- MA Municipal Police Coalition
Commission discussions around reporting:
• Concerns: conflict, costs of training
• What type of intervention
• Who/how to report
• Benefits of reporting, increased intervention

Status:
Draft of report still being worked on

Thoughts:
Incremental approach was worked
Training needed
Any Questions?

Phil Arkow
NationalLinkCoalition.org
arkowpets@snip.net

Jessica Bibbo
BenRose.org
Jbibbo@benrose.org

Kara Holmquist
MSPCA.org
kholmquist@mspca.org

Animal Abuse, Animal Hoarding and Elder Abuse: Challenges and Strategies for Adult Protective Services